

Rethinking Inclusive Islamic Education: A Conceptual Analysis of Tariq Ramadan's Thought in the Indonesian Context

Anis Sukmawati^{1*}, Ali Mas'ud², M. Yunus Abu Bakar³, Dulyawit Naknawa⁴

^{1,2,3}UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya, Surabaya, Indonesia

⁴ Ramkhamhaeng University, Bangkok, Thailand

ARTICLE INFO:

Keyword:

Inclusive Education;
Islamic Education;
Tariq Ramadan.

Correspondence Author:

anis.sukmawati@uinsa.ac.id

ABSTRACT

*This article aims to examine the concept of inclusive Islamic education from the perspective of Tariq Ramadan's thought and reflecting on the extent to which the concept of inclusive education offered by Tariq Ramadan can be linked to the dynamics of contemporary Islamic education in Indonesia. In general, Islamic education in Indonesia remains largely normative and formalistic, with a strong emphasis on religious identity, yet it provides insufficient space for social dialogue, critical reflection, and the appreciation of diversity. Tariq Ramadan offers an inclusive framework grounded in the principles of being faithful and being open and the notion of multiple belongings, which highlight the importance of cultivating a strong Muslim identity while remaining open, adaptable, and actively engaged in a pluralistic society. This study employs a descriptive qualitative approach through a literature review of Tariq Ramadan's primary works, national curriculum documents, and relevant academic sources. This study finds that Tariq Ramadan's concept of inclusivity is relevant to the notion of *musawah* (equality), which aligns with the objectives of the Project for Strengthening the Profile of Pancasila Students and Rahmatan lil 'Alamin (P5RA). However, its implementation remains largely symbolic and has yet to engage with more complex and tangible social realities. This article identifies existing implementation gaps and offers a conceptual reflection on how inclusive principles may be reconsidered within the discourse of Islamic education in Indonesia.*

How to Cite:

Sukmawati, Anis., et.al., (2026). Rethinking Inclusive Islamic Education: A Conceptual Analysis Of Tariq Ramadan's Thought In The Indonesian Context *Paedagogia: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 15(1), 67-84. <https://doi.org/10.24239/pdg.Vol15.Iss1.1035>.



<https://doi.org/10.24239/pdg.Vol15.Iss1.1035>

This is an open access article under the CC-BY-NC license



Introduction

The discourse on inclusive Islamic education is currently in a dynamic that is not simple. On the one hand, Islamic education has an important role in maintaining the teachings and religious identity of the people. However, on the other hand, life in an increasingly diverse society requires education to not only maintain identity, but also foster an open attitude, the ability to dialogue, responsibility as a citizen, and sensitivity to cultural diversity. This situation raises a fundamental question, whether Islamic education is moving from an approach that tends to be defensive towards a model that is more contributive and oriented towards social ethics, without having to lose its theological footing. It is within this broader tension that Islamic education must be re-examined amid the dynamics of globalisation and the complexities of modern society.

Amid the dynamics of globalisation and the complexities of modern society, education can no longer be perceived merely as a means of knowledge transmission. It must evolve into an inclusive, humanistic, and transformative space for character development. The challenges faced by education today extend beyond cognitive dimensions to include its capacity to accommodate the cultural, religious, and social diversity of learners within an atmosphere of equality and mutual respect. In this context, the paradigm of inclusive education becomes essential to examine and integrate into the development of the Islamic education curriculum.

One initiative aimed at integrating inclusive values can be seen in the Project for Strengthening the Profile of Pancasila Students: *Rahmatan lil 'Alamin* (P5RA), as part of the Merdeka Curriculum. One of the principles applied is related to the principle of *musawah* (equality), which emphasizes the importance of fostering inclusive and anti-discriminatory attitudes.¹ But in reality, discriminatory cases are still often found, especially in the educational environment. As happened at SMKN 2 Padang, West Sumatra, where a non-Muslim student was forced to wear a jilbab.² In 2021 at SDN 051 Tarakan, North Kalimantan, there were allegations of discrimination against three students who were declared not promoted three times because they adhered to the Jehovah's cult.³ This incident triggered a public debate on religious tolerance in the context of education and showed the shortcomings of the education curriculum in

¹ Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Islam Kementerian Agama RI Direktorat KKSK Madrasah, "Panduan Pengembangan Projek Penguatan Profil Pelajar Pancasila Dan Profil Pelajar Rahmatan Lil Alamin," 2022.

² Banu Adikara, "Kasus Intoleransi di Sekolah Ada Karena Eksklusivitas - Jawa Pos," Kasus Intoleransi di Sekolah Ada Karena Eksklusivitas - Jawa Pos, February 8, 2021, <https://www.jawapos.com/pendidikan/01311222/kasus-intoleransi-di-sekolah-ada-karena-eksklusivitas>.

³ Achmad Risky Arwani Maulidi, "Berbagai Kasus Diskriminasi terhadap Kebebasan Beragama Terjadi Selama 10 Tahun Jokowi," NU Online, accessed May 20, 2025, <https://nu.or.id/nasional/berbagai-kasus-diskriminasi-terhadap-kebebasan-beragama-terjadi-selama-10-tahun-jokowi-Au5cB>.

accommodating the values of respect for diversity, thus potentially violating individual rights and creating a non-inclusive environment.

A similar incident occurred in Parepare, South Sulawesi, the Parepare Muslim Community Forum (FM2P) provoked the construction of Gamaliel Christian School to be stopped.⁴ This was based on fears of discord in a predominantly Muslim neighborhood. In reality, however, this incident reflects the existence of exclusivism within the community. The Islamic education curriculum, which has not been fully integrated with the principles of inclusivity and tolerance of religious diversity, has resulted in a lack of understanding of the need for coexistence in a plural society.

This is in line with the statement of K.H. Abdul Halim Mahfudz, Chairman of the Waqf Board of Tebuireng Pesantren, who stated that religious intolerance and radicalism are caused by exclusivist ideologies in society, which include increasingly homogeneous social patterns and social environments.⁵ This incident explains that the concept of inclusive Islamic education has not been fully actualized. The concept of religious moderation, which has been popular in the last two decades, has had a significant impact on increasing religious tolerance in Indonesia. Although there are still some incidents of intolerance. This shows that there are still shortcomings in the implementation of the concept of moderation in the Islamic education curriculum. This risks giving birth to a generation that is difficult to accept differences and has the potential to increase intolerance in society. In this context, contemporary thoughts on inclusive education become very relevant to be raised and used as inspiration in curriculum development.

One of the contemporary thinkers who offers progressive ideas on the issue of education and diversity is Tariq Ramadan. With the concept of inclusiveness offered by Tariq Ramadan, it can strengthen the formation of an inclusive and adaptive Islamic education paradigm to the changing times. This European Muslim intellectual emphasizes the importance of intercultural dialogue, respect for plurality, and the formation of human characters who are not only religious but also ethical and socially concerned.⁶ Indonesia, as a country with a plural and multicultural society, Islamic education faces a tough challenge to nurture a generation that adheres to Islamic values while embracing diversity.

Contemporary Islamic education prioritizes an inclusive stance by harmonizing the Islamic religious education framework with general education

⁴ Kompasiana.com, "Kasus Penolakan Pembangunan Sekolah Kristen Gamaliel Parepare, Sulawesi Selatan Halaman 1 - Kompasiana.Com," January 5, 2025, https://www.kompasiana.com/amruldd1323/677a7d1ac925c453aa39e533/kasus-penolakan-pembangunan-sekolah-kristen-gamaliel-parepare-sulawesi-selatan?utm_source=chatgpt.com.

⁵ Tatak Santoso, "Pesantren Tebuireng: Intoleransi Agama Menguat Karena Tumbuhnya Eksklusivisme Di Masyarakat - Institut Leimena," November 29, 2022, <https://leimena.org/pesantren-tebuireng-intoleransi-agama-menguat-karena-tumbuhnya-eksklusivisme-di-masyarakat/>.

⁶ Tariq Ramadan, *The Quest for Meaning: Developing a Philosophy of Pluralism* (Allen Lane, 2010).

and other disciplines.⁷ Therefore, the Islamic education curriculum must be in tune with the needs of contemporary society while still adhering to the principles of moderation, tolerance, and respect for diversity. In this endeavor, the exploration of contemporary thought, as proposed by Tariq Ramadan, becomes indispensable to enrich the methodology in developing an Islamic education curriculum that is more inclusive, contextually relevant, and in tune with the nation's sociocultural reality.

Although various studies have examined the thought of Tariq Ramadan, there remains a gap in comprehensively understanding how the concept of inclusivity can be integrated into the Islamic education curriculum. Most previous research has focused primarily on theoretical aspects, without elaborating on practical implementation within curriculum development.⁸ Some works advocate for reform in Islamic thought as a response to the challenges of Western modernity.⁹ Other studies highlight a key element of his theology of education that Islam is inherently centred on education. Education, in this view, cultivates a commitment to social justice, and religious experience is realised through tolerant educational practices and inclusive da'wah.¹⁰

Based on this analysis, it is evident that further in-depth research is required to effectively integrate Tariq Ramadan's inclusive framework into the Islamic education curriculum in Indonesia. Accordingly, this article seeks to critically re-examine the relevance of Tariq Ramadan's inclusive framework in light of the current discourse on Islamic education in Indonesia. The novelty of this study lies in its effort to provide a conceptual analysis that situates Ramadan's thought within the epistemological and institutional landscape of Indonesian Islamic education. It is expected that this research will offer a meaningful conceptual contribution to the advancement of Islamic education that is more adaptive, progressive, and responsive to both global and local challenges.

At a more fundamental level, the question is not only about how this idea is applied in practice, but whether the way of thinking and the scientific basis are indeed compatible. Islamic education in Indonesia is shaped by a religious framework that is integrated with the state based on Pancasila, a discourse of religious moderation, and a learning tradition that relies heavily on fiqh.

⁷ Nihayatur Rofiqoh and M Yunus Abu Bakar, "The Relevance of the Concept of Islamic Education in Ibnu Khaldun's Perspective in the Contemporary Era," *Edunesia: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan* 6, no. 1 (January 6, 2025): 123–38, <https://doi.org/10.51276/edu.v6i1.1060>.

⁸ Theguh Saumantri, "Pluralisme dan Inklusivitas dalam Masyarakat Multikultural Perspektif Pemikiran Tariq Ramadan," *Zawiyah: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* 9, no. 1 (August 22, 2023): 135, <https://doi.org/10.31332/zjpi.v9i1.5899>.

⁹ Ahmad Nabil Amir, "Tariq Ramadan: Inclusive and Plural Value in Islamic Intellectual Tradition," *Al-Risalah: Jurnal Studi Agama Dan Pemikiran Islam* 13, no. 1 (January 19, 2022): 50–73, <https://doi.org/10.34005/alrisalah.v13i1.1550>.

¹⁰ Bambang Qomaruzzaman and Busro Busro, "Tolerance Islam Theology of Education Hermeneutic Reading of Tariq Ramadan Thought," *Qijis (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)* 7, no. 2 (2019): 203, <https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v7i2.5128>.

Meanwhile, Tariq Ramadan's reformist thinking departs from an ethical approach based on maqāṣid and contextual ijtihad, which emphasizes moral goals rather than simply compliance with the law. Therefore, this research does not necessarily consider the two to be compatible, but tries to critically examine whether the Ramadan thought framework can really be conceptually reconciled with the perspective of Islamic education in Indonesia.

Methods

This study employs a descriptive qualitative approach using library research as its primary method.¹¹ The objective is to explore the relationship between the concept of inclusivity in Tariq Ramadan's thought and its potential implementation within the Islamic education curriculum in Indonesia. Data were collected from a range of relevant primary and secondary sources¹², including Tariq Ramadan's key works such as *Western Muslims and the Future of Islam*, *Radical Reform*, and *What I Believe*, as well as official documents of the Merdeka Curriculum and the guidelines of the Project for Strengthening the Profile of Pancasila Students: *Rahmatan lil 'Alamin* (P5RA), published by the Directorate of KKSK Madrasah of the Ministry of Religious Affairs. Additional supporting data were drawn from recent academic articles and research reports on the implementation of P5RA in Islamic educational institutions, alongside literature on inclusive education, Islamic educational philosophy, and intercultural studies. Through inductive reasoning¹³, the data were analysed interpretively through a thematic content analysis approach, aiming to identify recurring patterns, key themes, and conceptual linkages between the values of inclusivity in Ramadan's thought and the current realities of the Islamic education curriculum.

Results

Biography and Scholarly Background of Tariq Ramadan

Widely recognized as a modern Islamic thinker, Tariq Ramadan is known for his contributions to the conversation about Islam in the modern world, especially in the context of relations between Muslims and Western societies. Ramadan was born on 26 August 1962 in Geneva, Switzerland. His father, Said Ramadan, was a prominent Islamic scholar and an influential figure in the establishment of Muslim organisations throughout Europe. He is the grandson of the founder of the Muslim Brotherhood, Imam Shahid Hasan Al Banna, which

¹¹ Norman K. Denzin and Yvonna S. Lincoln, *Handbook of Qualitative Research* (Pustaka Pelajar, 2010), <https://openlibrary.telkomuniversity.ac.id/pustaka/9769/handbook-of-qualitative-research.html>.

¹² Samapti Paul et al., *Handbook on Research Methodology* (Academic Guru Publishing House, 2024).

¹³ Theophilus Azungah, "Qualitative Research: Deductive and Inductive Approaches to Data Analysis," *Qualitative Research Journal* 18, no. 4 (October 31, 2018): 383–400, <https://doi.org/10.1108/QRJ-D-18-00035>.

is a highly respected Islamic movement throughout the Islamic world.¹⁴ He obtained his formal education at the University of Geneva, where he obtained degrees in Islam and philosophy. He also studied at Al-Azhar University in Cairo, which is one of the largest Islamic educational institutions in the world. Ramadan taught at the Faculty of Theology and St. Anthony's College at Oxford University.

Ramadan emphasizes the importance of inclusivity and intercultural dialogue. In his book '*Western Muslims and the Future of Islam*,' he offers the idea of '*dār ash-shabāda*,' meaning a place where Muslims can maintain their religious identity and actively participate in secular society.¹⁵ This concept is a response to the problems Muslims face in the West, where they are often caught up in stereotypes and discrimination. Ramadan contends that Muslims must engage proactively with the broader society and uphold universal ethical values such as justice and tolerance.

One of Tariq Ramadan's most influential works, *Radical Reform: Islamic Ethics and Liberation*, advocates for a profound rethinking of Islamic jurisprudence, grounded in a more inclusive ethical framework. In this book, Ramadan argues for the importance of reviving *maqāsid al-shari'ah* (the goals of sharia) as a dynamic and contextualized ethical foundation to respond to the challenges of modernity. *Maqasid* is not a static framework but rather a moral and spiritual guide that encourages Muslims to strive for justice, safeguard the public good, and respect human dignity in an ever-changing age.¹⁶ Similarly, in *What I Believe*, he reiterates the need for reform in Islamic thought, with a strong emphasis on ethics and universal values that transcend religious boundaries.¹⁷ Furthermore, in *The Quest for Meaning: Developing a Philosophy of Pluralism*, Ramadan advances the idea of building interfaith relationships founded on respect for diversity and a shared human search for meaning.¹⁸

Tariq Ramadan is also actively involved in various international forums and frequently delivers lectures at universities and educational institutions around the world. He is widely recognised as an intellectual capable of bridging the gap between Islamic tradition and the demands of modernity, consistently striving to offer solutions that are acceptable within diverse and pluralistic societies. Although his views have drawn criticism from various quarters, many scholars and observers regard his inclusive approach as a necessary step toward fostering constructive dialogue and mitigating tensions between Muslim and non-Muslim communities.¹⁹ Overall, Ramadan's scholarly contributions play a significant role

¹⁴ Robert Carle, "Tariq Ramadan and the Quest for a Moderate Islam," *Society* 48, no. 1 (2010): 58–69, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12115-010-9393-4>.

¹⁵ Tariq Ramadan, *Western Muslims and the Future of Islam* (Oxford University Press, 2005), <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195183566.001.0001>.

¹⁶ Tariq Ramadan, *Radical Reform: Islamic Ethics and Liberation* (Oxford University Press, 2008), <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195331714.001.0001>.

¹⁷ Tariq Ramadan, *What I Believe*, 1st Edition (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009).

¹⁸ Ramadan, *The Quest for Meaning: Developing a Philosophy of Pluralism*.

¹⁹ Carle, "Tariq Ramadan and the Quest for a Moderate Islam."

in shaping contemporary understandings of Islam in the modern context, emphasising the importance of inclusivity and dialogue in building a more harmonious society.

The Concept of Inclusiveness in Islamic Education According to Tariq Ramadan

In responding to the challenges posed by globalisation and increasingly complex cultural diversity, openness is needed without having to sacrifice beliefs. The integration of religious beliefs and understanding of plurality opens up space for healthy dialogue between cultures and religions, as well as cultivating an inclusive attitude that is needed in the middle of a diverse society.²⁰ This diversity encourages each individual to see in a broader perspective and increase understanding of their beliefs. However, maintaining a strong religious identity remains crucial so that individuals do not lose their spiritual direction in the midst of complexities of pluralistic life.²¹ Therefore, openness to difference should not be viewed as a dilution of faith, but rather as a conscious effort to enrich religious understanding through engagement with diverse social realities.

In responding to the complexities of contemporary social reality, Tariq Ramadan advances an inclusive vision that positions Muslims strategically: firmly rooted in their religious principles while simultaneously embracing universal human values. Ramadan states that globalization is not an excuse to diminish Islamic identity. Rather, it is an opportunity to strengthen Islamic identity through active interaction with diverse social realities. This basic concept of inclusivity is summarized in the principle of '*being faithful and being open*'.²² Ramadan states that strong faith does not mean shutting oneself off from the outside world; rather, it should mean being ready to speak, interact, and contribute in a society made up of many people. Openness and strong faith build social cohesion.

Ramadan also teaches the concept of '*multiple belongings*', whereby a person can have strong ties to both his or her religion and national community. Islamic identity and civic identity mutually enrich and deepen a Muslim's life experience. Based on these principles, Islamic education is positioned not only to strengthen students' faith personally but also to form a generation of Muslims who are capable of being a change, people who can actively contribute to building a just, peaceful, and civilized social order around the world.

Ramadan also strongly criticized the '*ghetto mentality*', which refers to the habit of certain Muslim groups to isolate themselves, interact only with people

²⁰ Abdurrohman Abdurrohman, Adiyono Adiyono, and Makmur Harun, "Dissemination of Faith in the Early Muslim Community in the Mecca Period: An Analysis of the Process and Its Impact on Islamic Faith Education," *International Journal Ihyā Ulum Al-Dīn* 25, no. 2 (2023): 112–23, <https://doi.org/10.21580/ihya.25.2.18199>; Dan Heist and Ram Cnaan, "Faith-Based International Development Work: A Review," *Religions* 7, no. 3 (2016): 19, <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel7030019>.

²¹ Kasim Randeree, "Demography, Demand and Devotion: Driving the Islamic Economy," *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 11, no. 2 (2019): 301–19, <https://doi.org/10.1108/jima-06-2018-0102>.

²² Ramadan, *Western Muslims and the Future of Islam*.

within their community, and fear being open to foreign cultures. He contends that Islamic education must dismantle this insular mindset by developing a curriculum rooted in universal human values, intercultural encounters, and collaborative interfaith social initiatives. In works such as *To Be a European Muslim and Western Muslims and the Future of Islam*, Ramadan articulates a vision of Islamic education that not only maintains core teachings of faith such as tawhid and Ahklaq, but also incorporates education on human rights, social justice, pluralism, and active citizenship.²³ He argues that the 'ghetto mentality' suppresses both intellectual and spiritual potential, as it confines individuals to homogeneous thinking and discourages them from confronting the challenges presented by diversity. He encouraged Muslims to be the driving force in creating a more inclusive society, by facing challenges and addressing diversity with an open mind. Engagement in wider social life does not undermine faith but rather can strengthen it by offering a broader perspective.²⁴

Gaps in the Implementation of the Islamic Education Curriculum

The reform of the Islamic education curriculum in Indonesia, one of which is through aims to strengthen the moderate and adaptive character of students. However, the extent to which this programme succeeds in internalising inclusive values remains a critical question. In general, the Islamic education curriculum in Indonesia (including in Madrasahs, Modern Islamic Boarding Schools, and institutions offering Islamic Religious Education) has led to efforts to implement inclusive concepts. Some of them are reflected through the Project for Strengthening the Profile of Pancasila Students: *Rahmatan lil 'Alamin* (P5RA), which is integrated with religious moderation values.

The Project for Strengthening the Profile of Pancasila Students (P5) in the Merdeka Curriculum has six main dimensions, namely 1) Believing, Fearing God Almighty, and Having Noble Character; 2) Global Diversity; 3) Mutual Cooperation; 4) Independence; 5) Critical Thinking; and 6) Creativity. Meanwhile, the Profile of Students *Rahmatan lil Alamin* (RA) implemented in madrasah includes ten main values. These values are 1) Civilization (*Ta'addub*), 2) Exemplary (*Qudwah*) 3) Citizenship and Nationality (*Muwat'ana*), 4) Taking the Middle Way (*Tawassut*), 5) Balanced (*Tawāzun*), 6) Straight and Firm (*I'tidal*), 7) Equality (*Musāwāh*), 8) Deliberation (*Syūra*), 9) Tolerance (*Tasāmu*), and 10) Dynamic and Innovative (*Taṭammur wa Ibtikār*). The integration of P5 and RA in madrasah is known as The Project for Strengthening the Profile of Pancasila Students. This project aims to form students who not only understand and practice the values of Pancasila but also moderate and inclusive Islamic values. P5 emphasizes universal national values in accordance with Pancasila, and RA adds moderate and inclusive Islamic values in accordance with the characteristics of madrasah. Thus, P5RA is

²³ Ibid..

²⁴ Laura Upenieks and Christopher G. Ellison, "Religious Doubt and Mental Well-Being in Later Life: Is Humility a Protective Resource?," *Journal of Psychology and Theology* 52, no. 4 (2024): 361–78, <https://doi.org/10.1177/00916471241241544>.

an integration effort to produce a balanced learner profile between national and Islamic values.

P5RA in madrasah or Islamic schools aims to realise graduates who not only have academic and professional competencies, but also characters inspired by Pancasila values and universal Islamic principles. Broadly, the programme seeks to shape students with a dual identity: as Indonesian citizens grounded in Pancasila and as Muslims committed to the ethos of compassion (*rahmatan lil alamin*). One of its concrete strategies is the implementation of contextualised, project-based learning that engages students with both local and global issues, encouraging critical discussion and problem-solving.²⁵ This approach is intended to foster a harmonious integration of national and Islamic identity that is applicable in everyday life. For instance, character development through contextualised and interdisciplinary project-based activities enables students to internalise and apply these values in real-life situations within their communities. As a result, students are not only equipped with theoretical understanding but are also capable of translating inclusive and ethical principles into tangible social practices.²⁶

In practice, the implementation of P5RA in several schools has shown varying approaches. At MAN 2 Magetan, the programme was implemented through the establishment of a dedicated team and the execution of four out of five planned stages of the P5RA framework.²⁷ MAN 3 Bantul has adopted P5RA as a co-curricular activity aimed at fostering students' character development.²⁸ Meanwhile, at MA NU Banyuputih, the implementation is more comprehensive, encompassing intracurricular, co-curricular, extracurricular, and school culture components.²⁹ Indicators of success include students' appreciation for cultural

²⁵ Dini Irawati et al., "Profil Pelajar Pancasila Sebagai Upaya Mewujudkan Karakter Bangsa," *Edumaspul - Jurnal Pendidikan* 6, no. 1 (2022): 1224–38, <https://doi.org/10.33487/edumaspul.v6i1.3622>; Kunti I. Sabarniati and Istanto, "Implementasi Proyek Penguatan Profil Pelajar Pancasila Berbasis Al-Islam Kemuhammadiyah Di Sekolah Menengah Atas Muhammadiyah 2 Surakarta," *Didaktika Jurnal Kependidikan* 13, no. 2 (2024): 1375–92, <https://doi.org/10.58230/27454312.584>.

²⁶ Mohamad R. Hamzah et al., "Proyek Profil Pelajar Pancasila Sebagai Penguatan Pendidikan Karakter Pada Peserta Didik," *Jurnal Jendela Pendidikan* 2, no. 04 (2022): 553–59, <https://doi.org/10.57008/jjp.v2i04.309>; Andriani Safitri, Dwi Wulandari, and Yusuf T. Herlambang, "Proyek Penguatan Profil Pelajar Pancasila: Sebuah Orientasi Baru Pendidikan Dalam Meningkatkan Karakter Siswa Indonesia," *Jurnal Basicedu* 6, no. 4 (2022): 7076–86, <https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v6i4.3274>.

²⁷ Tiara Indah Wahyuni, "Implementasi Proyek Penguatan Profil Pelajar Pancasila Dan Profil Pelajar Rahmatan Lil'alamin Di MAN 2 Magetan," 2024.

²⁸ Reza Oky Iswiranto, "Implementasi Proyek Penguatan Profil Pelajar Pancasila Dan Rahmatan Lil 'Alamin (P5RA) Dalam Menumbuhkan Karakter Siswa Di MAN 3 Bantul," *Jurnal Syntax Admiration* 6, no. 2 (2025): 1279–95.

²⁹ Endon Nurcahyati, Noor Miyono, and Rasiman, "Implementasi Penguatan Profil Pelajar Pancasila Dan Rahmatan Lil'alamin (P5RA) Pada Dimensi Berkebinekaan Global Di MA NU 01 Banyuputih Batang," *Pendas : Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Dasar* 10, no. 01 (March 27, 2025): 201–13, <https://doi.org/10.23969/jp.v10i01.22313>.

diversity, engagement in cross-cultural interactions, reflective thinking, sense of responsibility, and commitment to social justice in madrasah activities. To assess the effectiveness of integrating inclusive values, a study was conducted to develop the P5 Theme Questionnaire (KT P5) instrument as an evaluative instrument. This tool measures the extent to which the P5RA project has succeeded in shaping students' character in alignment with Pancasila values in selected pioneer schools across Indonesia.³⁰ Efforts to instil the values of tolerance in education have also been pursued through both Islamic Religious Education textbooks and classroom instructional practices. In heterogeneous classrooms, teachers are expected to demonstrate fairness and impartiality, ensuring equal attention and respect toward students from diverse backgrounds..³¹

A comparison of the inclusive concept according to Tariq Ramadan and the implementation of P5RA based on research data is presented in Table 1.

Table.1 Tariq Ramadan's Concept of Inclusiveness and the Application of P5RA

Aspects	Concept of Inclusiveness according to Tariq Ramadan	Application of P5RA
Education Orientation	Emphasises the importance of maintaining a strong Islamic faith while actively contributing to a pluralistic society—summarised in the principle of <i>being faithful and being open</i>	Focus on protecting Islamic identity, so as not to 'dissolve' in globalisation (defensive, not dialogical)
Curriculum Materials	Grounded in <i>tawhid</i> (the oneness of God), but contextualised through engagement with contemporary social issues such as human rights, national identity, and justice	Dominant in fiqh, tawhid, and normative morals, without social elaboration; minimal contextualisation
Teaching Methods	Advocates a dialogical and critical approach to education, based on reflective inquiry and lived social realities	Still classical, one-way, rote-based; very limited space for dialogue
P5RA Activities	Encourages the implementation of social projects that transcend religious and communal boundaries, highlighting shared human values	Many activities remain ritualistic-ceremonial in nature, such as religious competitions; do not touch on real social issues
Measurement of Success	Promotes the development of tolerance, the capacity for dialogue, and meaningful contributions to pluralistic and multicultural societies	Measured through memorisation, regularity of worship, and formal discipline; <i>musawah</i> and inclusion values are not yet evident

³⁰ A. Rachman et al., "The Development and Validation of the 'Kuesioner Tema Proyek Penguatan Profil Pelajar Pancasila' (KT P5): A New Tool for Strengthening the Pancasila Student Profile in Indonesian Pioneer Schools," *Heliyon* 10, no. 16 (2024), <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2024.e35912>.

³¹ Rizky Martha Oktavia and Fauzi Muharom, "Analisis Nilai-Nilai Toleransi Dalam Buku 'Senang Belajar Agama Islam Dan Budi Pekerti' Di Kelas IV Dan V SD Di Kab. Karanganyar," *Paedagogia: Jurnal Pendidikan* 10, no. 2 (October 4, 2021), <https://doi.org/10.24239/pdg.Vol10.Iss2.167>.

Based on some of these studies, there is a gap in the implementation of the curriculum through P5RA that occurs in the field. The orientation of Islamic education in various institutions still focuses on preserving Islamic identity from being 'absorbed' by the forces of globalisation. This emphasis is reflected in curriculum approaches that tend to be dominated by fiqh, tawhid and normative morals, which are taught classically with an emphasis on memorisation and minimal space for dialogue or contextual reflection. Although P5RA has been implemented, many of the projects are ritualistic or ceremonial, such as religious-themed competitions, without inspiring students' active involvement in dealing with real social issues. Measures of educational success are still determined by formal aspects such as the ability to memorise material, regularity in performing worship such as prayer, and behavioural discipline, which do not fully reflect the internalisation of inclusive values, tolerance, and social contribution which are the main objectives of transformative Islamic education.

When compared to the inclusive concept according to Tariq Ramadan, many applications of P5RA in both madrasas and schools are still partial, including many that focus on strengthening Islamic identity defensively, rather than strengthening Islamic identity for social contribution. Intercultural learning has yet to become a core component of the curriculum. An active attitude of dialogue with diversity has not really been trained in praxis, only taught theoretically. One of the key aspects of P5RA is *musawah* (equality/inclusion), which aligns with the principles of social inclusivity. The concept of inclusion offered by Tariq Ramadan calls for openness, cross-border participation, and respect for plurality, whether in the form of ethnicity, culture, religion, or social expression.

Discussion

Conceptual Implications for Islamic Education in Indonesia

Even though Tariq Ramadan is widely known as a reformist Muslim intellectual, his thoughts are not free from controversy. In European public discourse, he was criticized for being ambiguous in his positioning between reformism and political Islam, partly due to his intellectual lineage and broader suspicion of Muslim scholars in secular contexts. These controversies demonstrate that Ramadan's ideas operate in a contested intellectual field and should therefore be examined critically rather than adopted unreflectively.

It is also important to recognize that Ramadan's inclusive paradigm emerged in the context of European Muslim minorities shaped by secular constitutionalism and debates over citizenship and integration. In contrast, Indonesia represents a Muslim-majority society where Islamic education is institutionally integrated into the state framework. These contextual differences indicate that the transfer of the Ramadan framework to Islamic education in Indonesia requires careful adaptation and not direct transplantation.

Furthermore, Ramadan's emphasis on maqāṣid-based ethical reasoning prioritizes moral goals and contextual interpretation over rigid legal formalism. Meanwhile, Indonesia's national curriculum operates within competency standards, administrative regulations, and measurable learning outcomes. These structural differences create potential tensions between dynamic ethical paradigms and policy-driven educational frameworks. Therefore, positioning Ramadan theory as an authoritative foundation for curriculum development requires critical negotiation between ethical flexibility and institutional structure. In light of these contextual and epistemological tensions, the following reflections outline possible conceptual implications for Islamic education in Indonesia.

In order to realise a generation of Muslims who believe and contribute to a pluralistic society, a systematic effort is needed to integrate the idea of inclusiveness into the curriculum. The integration of Tariq Ramadan's idea of inclusiveness into the Islamic education curriculum demands a fundamental reorientation of the purpose of education itself. Islamic education may need to be reconsidered beyond the maintenance of exclusive identity, toward a more dialogical and socially contributive orientation. This paradigm shift marks a transformation from a conservative approach to a more progressive, dynamic and dialogical approach in facing the challenges of multiculturalism and globalisation.³²

Conceptually, Tariq Ramadan envisions Islam as a value system that is inherently non-exclusive and capable of engaging in dialogue with other traditions through the continual reinterpretation of religious teachings within an evolving social context. Consequently, the development of the Islamic education curriculum should extend beyond the reinforcement of spiritual and ritual dimensions to include the integration of science, social ethics, and 21st-century competencies that are both contextual and relevant.³³ In doing so, Islamic education can nurture learners who are equipped to engage with societal plurality in an open and constructive manner, and who are capable of making meaningful contributions to social benefit.

This reorientation calls for changes in curriculum structure and learning methods. The learning process should change from a one-way, rote system to a collaborative and participatory approach where teachers and students collaborate to gain information. When stakeholders such as teachers, students, parents, and the community actively participate, it is crucial to build the character of students who are not only religiously responsible but also socially responsible.³⁴ This

³² Saumantri, "Pluralisme dan Inklusivitas dalam Masyarakat Multikultural Perspektif Pemikiran Tariq Ramadan."

³³ Zahra B. R. Ramadhani, Depict P. Adi, and Zamhaqiyullah, "Deradikalisasi Agama Melalui Internalisasi Pendidikan Inklusif-Multikultural," *Al-Adabiyah Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam* 1, no. 2 (2020): 164–80, <https://doi.org/10.35719/adabiyah.v1i2.19>; Saumantri, "Pluralisme dan Inklusivitas dalam Masyarakat Multikultural Perspektif Pemikiran Tariq Ramadan."

³⁴ Ramadhani, Adi, and Zamhaqiyullah, "Deradikalisasi Agama Melalui Internalisasi Pendidikan Inklusif-Multikultural."

method allows the curriculum to serve as a tool for inclusive social transformation.

The next step is the preparation of inclusive, values-based teaching materials. Themes such as social justice, human rights, and intercultural conversations should be part of the subject matter, as they are an overview of humanitarian ethics from an Islamic perspective. This is in line with Tariq Ramadan's opinion, who calls for Islamic education to internalize empathy, social responsibility, and respect for diversity in every aspect of its teaching.³⁵ For example, literature on social justice discusses religious texts normatively and relates them to real problems such as social inequality and marginalization of vulnerable groups.

In addition, educational materials that enable intercultural discussions can make the learning environment inclusive. Through the use of case studies, simulations, and intercultural debates, learners are encouraged not only to understand Islamic values in a normative sense, but also to cultivate skills in dialogue, critical thinking, and cross-cultural communication. This method enhances the spirit of multiculturalism and makes Islamic education more responsive to contemporary social dynamics.³⁶

Ramadan ideas can be integrated through dialogues, ethical discussions, cultural simulations, and interfaith and community social projects. This is an example of a progressive methodology. In addition to enhancing affective, social, and cognitive learning, educators can also raise students' awareness of justice, tolerance, and diversity.³⁷ Students actively participate in responding to issues that actually arise in society. Through these actions, Islamic education serves as a bridge between the social realities of the world and religious teachings.

The success of this method relies heavily on the teacher's role as a regulator who makes the learning environment safe and open. Teachers must not only deliver the material, but they must also encourage discussion, encourage students to have different opinions, and help students cooperate with others from different backgrounds. This is in accordance with the intercultural approach,

³⁵ Yusawinur Barella et al., "Multikulturalisme Dalam Pendidikan Islam: Membangun Kesadaran Dan Toleransi Dalam Keanekaragaman Budaya," *Indo-Mathedu Intellectuals Journal* 4, no. 3 (2023): 2028–39, <https://doi.org/10.54373/imeij.v4i3.476>; Naharudin Naharudin, "Pendidikan Islam Multikultural Sebagai Modal Sosial Budaya Masyarakat Pluralis (Studi Tradisi Ngejot Di Desa Lenek Kecamatan Aikmel Lombok Timur NTB)," *Jupe Jurnal Pendidikan Mandala* 4, no. 5 (2019), <https://doi.org/10.58258/jupe.v4i5.842>.

³⁶ Barella et al., "Multikulturalisme Dalam Pendidikan Islam: Membangun Kesadaran Dan Toleransi Dalam Keanekaragaman Budaya."

³⁷ Siswoyo A. Munandar and Muhamad Y. Sidiq, "Peran Kementerian Agama Dalam Penguatan Moderasi Beragama Melalui Pendidikan," *Jurnal Ilmiah Widya Borneo* 7, no. 2 (2024): 115–27, <https://doi.org/10.56266/widyaborneo.v7i2.325>; Qomaruzzaman and Busro, "Tolerance Islam Theology of Education Hermeneutic Reading of Tariq Ramadan Thought."

which regards diversity as a benefit in learning.³⁸ Consequently, Tariq Ramadan's strategy of embedding inclusivity into the Islamic education curriculum offers a transformative framework one that not only reinforces faith, but also equips learners to become empowered, tolerant, and socially responsible global citizens.

To assess the effectiveness of the proposed strategic measures, a well-defined evaluation model is essential. Evaluating the integration of Tariq Ramadan's inclusivity framework into the Islamic education curriculum can no longer rely solely on traditional, cognitively oriented indicators. Inclusive Islamic education requires a new evaluative paradigm one that goes beyond the assessment of memorization and ritual practices to include affective and social dimensions of student development. Indicators of success should encompass students' capacity for dialogue, their contributions to society, and their respect for diversity, as tangible manifestations of the shift from an exclusive to an inclusive and contributive educational model.

First, dialogue competence serves as a critical indicator in evaluating learners' ability to engage in constructive communication, both within the classroom and in broader community contexts. To assess this aspect, participatory observation, multicultural discussion forums, and peer feedback should be used. These methods should be able to demonstrate the dynamics of the discussion first-hand. *Secondly*, how well students can apply Islamic principles in their daily lives is shown by their social contributions. This evaluation is not limited to formal religious activities; it also includes community empowerment efforts, interfaith social projects, and social justice-based activities. Important means of assessing students' active engagement in inclusive social change are project-based assessments, reflective journals, and community service portfolios. *Third*, the main standard of tolerance in Islamic education is respect for differences. Students' ability to appreciate cultural, ethnic, and religious differences is reflected in their daily interactions. Cross-cultural simulations, interfaith discussion forums, and behavioral observations in cooperative activities across backgrounds are some of the ways that can be used to assess this element.

By combining these three criteria, the Islamic education evaluation system will be more consistent in assessing the success of a curriculum based on inclusive values. This method is in line with Tariq Ramadan's idea that education should build Muslim individuals who are strong in faith and help plural societies through understanding, tolerance, and cooperation across borders.

Conclusion

The inclusivity paradigm of Islamic education developed by Tariq Ramadan promotes the idea of a solid faith that is open to social plurality through the principle of being faithful and open and an awareness of multiple belongings.

³⁸ Germán A. S. Rojas, "Inclusion and Interculturality Lessons: Research Positions of Students in the Master's Program in Inclusive and Intercultural Education," *Revista De Gestão Social E Ambiental* 18, no. 6 (2024): e07496, <https://doi.org/10.24857/rgsa.v18n6-144>.

This concept asserts that Islamic education must go beyond exclusive and dogmatic approaches to build students who are tolerant, speak out, and contribute to a diverse society. According to Tariq Ramadan, although the Merdeka Curriculum through P5RA has incorporated some inclusive values, such as *musawab*, tolerance, and gotong royong, the implementation is still far from the inclusive spirit.

Its application is still limited to symbolic and ritualistic activities and does not reach the social reality as a whole. Ramadan says that the ideal Islamic education is one that forms a solid but not exclusive faith and produces students who actively contribute in a pluralistic and dynamic social environment. Therefore, Tariq Ramadan's concept of inclusivity offers a significant conceptual lens for rethinking the ethical orientation of Islamic education in Indonesia, while its contextual application requires further empirical exploration.

References

- Abdurrohm, Abdurrohm, Adiyono Adiyono, and Makmur Harun. "Dissemination of Faith in the Early Muslim Community in the Mecca Period: An Analysis of the Process and Its Impact on Islamic Faith Education." *International Journal Ihya Ulum Al-Din* 25, no. 2 (2023): 112–23. <https://doi.org/10.21580/ihya.25.2.18199>.
- Adikara, Banu. "Kasus Intoleransi di Sekolah Ada Karena Eksklusivitas - Jawa Pos." *Kasus Intoleransi di Sekolah Ada Karena Eksklusivitas - Jawa Pos*, February 8, 2021. <https://www.jawapos.com/pendidikan/01311222/kasus-intoleransi-di-sekolah-ada-karena-eksklusivitas>.
- Amir, Ahmad Nabil. "Tariq Ramadan: Inclusive and Plural Value in Islamic Intellectual Tradition." *Al-Risalah : Jurnal Studi Agama Dan Pemikiran Islam* 13, no. 1 (January 19, 2022): 50–73. <https://doi.org/10.34005/alrisalah.v13i1.1550>.
- Azungah, Theophilus. "Qualitative Research: Deductive and Inductive Approaches to Data Analysis." *Qualitative Research Journal* 18, no. 4 (October 31, 2018): 383–400. <https://doi.org/10.1108/QRJ-D-18-00035>.
- Barella, Yusawinur, Ana Fergina, Andi Achruh, and Hifza Hifza. "Multikulturalisme Dalam Pendidikan Islam: Membangun Kesadaran Dan Toleransi Dalam Keanekaragaman Budaya." *Indo-Mathedu Intellectuals Journal* 4, no. 3 (2023): 2028–39. <https://doi.org/10.54373/imeij.v4i3.476>.
- Carle, Robert. "Tariq Ramadan and the Quest for a Moderate Islam." *Society* 48, no. 1 (2010): 58–69. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12115-010-9393-4>.

- Denzin, Norman K., and Yvonna S. Lincoln. *Handbook of Qualitative Research*. Pustaka Pelajar, 2010. <https://openlibrary.telkomuniversity.ac.id/pustaka/9769/handbook-of-qualitative-research.html>.
- Direktorat KKSK Madrasah, Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Islam Kementerian Agama RI. "Panduan Pengembangan Proyek Penguatan Profil Pelajar Pancasila Dan Profil Pelajar Rahmatan Lil Alamin," 2022.
- Hamzah, Mohamad R., Yuniar Mujiwati, Intan M. Khamdi, M. I. Usman, and Mursyidah Z. Abidin. "Proyek Profil Pelajar Pancasila Sebagai Penguatan Pendidikan Karakter Pada Peserta Didik." *Jurnal Jendela Pendidikan* 2, no. 04 (2022): 553–59. <https://doi.org/10.57008/jjp.v2i04.309>.
- Heist, Dan, and Ram Cnaan. "Faith-Based International Development Work: A Review." *Religions* 7, no. 3 (2016): 19. <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel7030019>.
- Indah Wahyuni, Tiara. "Implementasi Proyek Penguatan Profil Pelajar Pancasila Dan Profil Pelajar Rahmatan Lil'Alamin Di MAN 2 Magetan," 2024.
- Irawati, Dini, Aji M. Iqbal, Aan Hasanah, and Bambang S. Arifin. "Profil Pelajar Pancasila Sebagai Upaya Mewujudkan Karakter Bangsa." *Edumaspul - Jurnal Pendidikan* 6, no. 1 (2022): 1224–38. <https://doi.org/10.33487/edumaspul.v6i1.3622>.
- Iswiranto, Reza Oky. "Implementasi Proyek Penguatan Profil Pelajar Pancasila Dan Rahmatan Lil 'Alamin (P5RA) Dalam Menumbuhkan Karakter Siswa Di MAN 3 Bantul." *Jurnal Syntax Admiration* 6, no. 2 (2025): 1279–95.
- Kompasiana.com. "Kasus Penolakan Pembangunan Sekolah Kristen Gamaliel Parepare, Sulawesi Selatan Halaman 1 - Kompasiana.Com," January 5, 2025. https://www.kompasiana.com/amruldd1323/677a7d1ac925c453aa39e533/kasus-penolakan-pembangunan-sekolah-kristen-gamaliel-parepare-sulawesi-selatan?utm_source=chatgpt.com.
- Maulidi, Achmad Risky Arwani. "Berbagai Kasus Diskriminasi terhadap Kebebasan Beragama Terjadi Selama 10 Tahun Jokowi." NU Online. Accessed May 20, 2025. <https://nu.or.id/nasional/berbagai-kasus-diskriminasi-terhadap-kebebasan-beragama-terjadi-selama-10-tahun-jokowi-Au5cB>.
- Munandar, Siswoyo A., and Muhamad Y. Sidiq. "Peran Kementerian Agama Dalam Penguatan Moderasi Beragama Melalui Pendidikan." *Jurnal Ilmiah Widya Borneo* 7, no. 2 (2024): 115–27. <https://doi.org/10.56266/widyaborneo.v7i2.325>.

- Naharudin, Naharudin. "Pendidikan Islam Multikultural Sebagai Modal Sosial Budaya Masyarakat Pluralis (Studi Tradisi Ngejot Di Desa Lenek Kecamatan Aikmel Lombok Timur NTB)." *Jupe Jurnal Pendidikan Mandala* 4, no. 5 (2019). <https://doi.org/10.58258/jupe.v4i5.842>.
- Nurcahyati, Endon, Noor Miyono, and Rasiman. "Implementasi Penguatan Profil Pelajar Pancasila Dan Rahmatal Lil'alam (P5RA) Pada Dimensi Berkebinekaan Global Di MA NU 01 Banyuputih Batang." *Pendas : Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Dasar* 10, no. 01 (March 27, 2025): 201–13. <https://doi.org/10.23969/jp.v10i01.22313>.
- Qomaruzzaman, Bambang, and Busro Busro. "Tolerance Islam Theology of Education Hermeneutic Reading of Tariq Ramadan Thought." *Qijis (Qudus International Journal of Islamic Studies)* 7, no. 2 (2019): 203. <https://doi.org/10.21043/qijis.v7i2.5128>.
- Rachman, A., H.Y.S. Putro, M.A. Rusandi, and D.D.B. Situmorang. "The Development and Validation of the 'Kuesioner Tema Proyek Penguatan Profil Pelajar Pancasila' (KT P5): A New Tool for Strengthening the Pancasila Student Profile in Indonesian Pioneer Schools." *Heliyon* 10, no. 16 (2024). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2024.e35912>.
- Ramadan, Tariq. *Radical Reform: Islamic Ethics and Liberation*. Oxford University Press, 2008. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195331714.001.0001>.
- Ramadan, Tariq. *The Quest for Meaning: Developing a Philosophy of Pluralism*. Allen Lane, 2010.
- Ramadan, Tariq. *Western Muslims and the Future of Islam*. Oxford University Press, 2005. <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780195183566.001.0001>.
- Ramadan, Tariq. *What I Believe*. 1st Edition. New York: Oxford University Press, 2009.
- Ramadhani, Zahra B. R., Depict P. Adi, and Zamhaqiullah. "Deradikalisasi Agama Melalui Internalisasi Pendidikan Inklusif-Multikultural." *Al-Adabiyah Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam* 1, no. 2 (2020): 164–80. <https://doi.org/10.35719/adabiyah.v1i2.19>.
- Randeree, Kasim. "Demography, Demand and Devotion: Driving the Islamic Economy." *Journal of Islamic Marketing* 11, no. 2 (2019): 301–19. <https://doi.org/10.1108/jima-06-2018-0102>.
- Rizky Martha Oktavia and Fauzi Muharom. "Analisis Nilai-Nilai Toleransi Dalam Buku 'Senang Belajar Agama Islam Dan Budi Pekerti' Di Kelas IV Dan V SD Di Kab. Karanganyar." *Paedagogia: Jurnal Pendidikan* 10, no. 2 (October 4, 2021). <https://doi.org/10.24239/pdg.Vol10.Iss2.167>.

- Rofiqoh, Nihayatur, and M Yunus Abu Bakar. "The Relevance of the Concept of Islamic Education in Ibnu Khladun's Perspective in the Contemporary Era." *Edunesia : Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan* 6, no. 1 (January 6, 2025): 123–38. <https://doi.org/10.51276/edu.v6i1.1060>.
- Rojas, Germán A. S. "Inclusion and Interculturality Lessons: Research Positions of Students in the Master's Program in Inclusive and Intercultural Education." *Revista De Gestão Social E Ambiental* 18, no. 6 (2024): e07496. <https://doi.org/10.24857/rgsa.v18n6-144>.
- Sabarniati, Kunti I. and Istanto. "Implementasi Proyek Penguatan Profil Pelajar Pancasila Berbasis Al-Islam Kemuhammadiyah Di Sekolah Menengah Atas Muhammadiyah 2 Surakarta." *Didaktika Jurnal Kependidikan* 13, no. 2 (2024): 1375–92. <https://doi.org/10.58230/27454312.584>.
- Safitri, Andriani, Dwi Wulandari, and Yusuf T. Herlambang. "Proyek Penguatan Profil Pelajar Pancasila: Sebuah Orientasi Baru Pendidikan Dalam Meningkatkan Karakter Siswa Indonesia." *Jurnal Basicedu* 6, no. 4 (2022): 7076–86. <https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v6i4.3274>.
- Santoso, Tatak. "Pesantren Tebuireng: Intoleransi Agama Menguat Karena Tumbuhnya Eksklusivisme Di Masyarakat - Institut Leimena," November 29, 2022. <https://leimena.org/pesantren-tebuireng-intoleransi-agama-menguat-karena-tumbuhnya-eksklusivisme-di-masyarakat/>.
- Saumantri, Theguh. "Pluralisme dan Inklusivitas dalam Masyarakat Multikultural Perspektif Pemikiran Tariq Ramadan." *Zawiyah: Jurnal Pemikiran Islam* 9, no. 1 (August 22, 2023): 135. <https://doi.org/10.31332/zjpi.v9i1.5899>.
- Upenieks, Laura, and Christopher G. Ellison. "Religious Doubt and Mental Well-Being in Later Life: Is Humility a Protective Resource?" *Journal of Psychology and Theology* 52, no. 4 (2024): 361–78. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00916471241241544>.